It Started at HORIZONS Web Series

EPISODE 4
Leveraging Data for Equity in a COVID-19 Economy
Next-Generation Labor Market Information
TWEET @ US!

@JFFtweets
@gatesfoundation
@Burning_Glass

#JFFHorizons
#equitablepathways
ABOUT JFF

Vision
A society in which economic advancement is attainable for all.

Mission
JFF is building a society in which everyone has access to the skills, resources, and credentials needed to achieve economic advancement.

To reach that goal, we accelerate the alignment, transformation, and reimagination of the American workforce and education systems.

Values
ABOUT BUILDING EQUITABLE PATHWAYS

What is our goal?
To dramatically increase the number of Black and Latinx youth, and youth experiencing poverty, ages 14-24, who have the agency, social capital, skills, and credentials needed to thrive in the workforce and in life.

What outcome do we seek?
Increased participation in multiple high-quality local pathways that drive labor market outcomes for Black and Latinx youth, and for youth experiencing poverty.

How will we do this?
A growing and sustainable network of intermediaries that model exemplar practices, serve as incubators of new ideas, and have the capacity, know-how and influence to drive cross-system engagement throughout regional pathways ecosystems.
BUILDING EQUITABLE PATHWAYS

SIX HYPOTHESES

Strong partnership and alignment with local K-12 schools and districts

Strong partnership and alignment with local postsecondary institutions

Articulated paths aligned to local labor market demands

Strong partnerships with local employers to advance opportunities for work-based learning

Sustainable business models

A policy agenda and a supporting strategy
For additional information on each of the six hypotheses, and examples of how our core intermediary partners are leading in each of them, visit JFF.org:

https://www.jff.org/resources/equitable-pathways-hypotheses-spotlights/
The Emerging Impact of the COVID-19 Recession

Understanding the impact of the pandemic on the U.S. labor market

Sara Lamback, Director
KEY TYPES OF LABOR MARKET INFORMATION

LMI includes a range of data related to the supply of and demand for labor in a specific region or area.

Supply data includes information about the current and potential workforce:

- Program and institutional data
- Demographic data
- Local commuting patterns and regional inflow/outflow

Demand data includes insights into short-term and long-term employer needs:

- Annual openings and vacancy rates
- Occupational and industry projections
- Real-time job posting data
IMPACT ON THE U.S. ECONOMY

The COVID-19 recession had a sudden impact in early 2020. And the effects will be felt long after the pandemic is under control. Despite re-openings in many sectors, the economy remains fragile in late 2020.

Unemployment

Spiked in April, reaching 14.7%—a level not seen since the 1930s, as most states shut down their economies.

Fell in November to 6.7%—but this is still above the pre-recession rate.

Food Insecurity

Has risen 17% since February, based on the increase in the number of participants in the federal Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program, also known as food stamps. More than 6 million people now receive this assistance.

Small Business Revenue

Fell 32.1% from January through mid-November 2020.

Nonessential businesses (entertainment, restaurants, personal services) were hit the hardest.

Several sectors that partially reopened in the summer (retail, transportation, hospitality) saw revenue decline again in August.

Household Financial Well-Being

Some 32.2% percent of households reported difficulty paying for usual expenses during the last week of September.
Unemployment remains high in areas associated with travel, leisure, discretionary spending, and face-to-face interaction. Health care, IT, and finance have been insulated.

**Most Impacted Industry Sectors, by Unemployment Rate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry Sectors</th>
<th>Unemployment Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transportation and utilities</td>
<td>5.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining, quarrying, oil and gas extraction</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leisure and hospitality</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Most Impacted Occupations, by Unemployment Rate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupations</th>
<th>Unemployment Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transportation and material moving occupations</td>
<td>6.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal care and service workers</td>
<td>10.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food preparation and serving workers</td>
<td>15.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Least Impacted Industry Sectors, by Unemployment Rate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry Sectors</th>
<th>Unemployment Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial activities</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and health services</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Least Impacted Occupations, by Unemployment Rate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupations</th>
<th>Unemployment Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal occupations</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care practitioners and technical occupations</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architectural and engineering occupations</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer and mathematical occupations</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IMPACT ON KEY POPULATIONS

Young people, women, and workers in low-wage occupations have been hit hardest because they fill essential frontline jobs and their positions are most affected by pandemic-related shutdowns.

AGE

Young workers (ages 16-19 and 20-24) have the highest unemployment rates of any age group:

- In April, the unemployment rate for workers ages 16-19 jumped to a staggering 31.9%.\(^9\)
- While the overall rate for ages 16-19 has declined to 15.9%, both Black and Hispanic teens had unemployment rates over 20%.\(^{10}\)

INCOME\(^{11}\)

- Low-wage workers face the greatest job losses.
- 19.7% of low-wage workers are unemployed.
- 5.7% of middle-wage workers are unemployed.
- 0.8 percent of high-wage workers are unemployed.

EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT\(^{12}\)

- Workers with the lowest levels of education have the highest unemployment rates.
- 10.6% of people who did not complete high school are unemployed.
- 4.8% of people with a bachelor's degree or higher are unemployed.

FAMILIES WITH CHILDREN\(^{13}\)

Low-income families with children were the most likely to experience an economic shock related to COVID-19. Three out of five low-income families with children lost a job or lost income. Also, about half of Black and Hispanic families with children faced job or income loss.
Despite lower unemployment overall in the third quarter of 2020, Black workers and Hispanic and Asian women have significantly higher unemployment rates than members of other racial and ethnic groups.
Overall job postings remain below pre-recession levels, but the retail trade sector has seen an uptick in postings.

Greatest growth in demand
Health care and transportation credentials have seen the greatest increase in demand in job postings between March and September 2020. These include:

- Licensed mental health counselor (+265%)
- Commercial driver’s license, Class A (+66%)
- Home health aide (+54%)
- Critical care registered nurse (+36%)
ABILITY TO TELEWORK AND IMPLICATIONS

• Younger workers (15-24) are only half as likely to be in occupations that allow for telework as members of older age cohorts.

• Overall, job postings for remote opportunities have increased 41 percent since 2019. Key baseline skills for these remote jobs include:
  • Communication
  • Teamwork
  • Problem solving

VULNERABLE WORKERS, BY AGE

- Around 20 percent of workers nationwide are in “highly exposed” industries, which include restaurants, travel, retail, and entertainment.
- Younger workers — especially those starting out on career pathways are most vulnerable.
  - Those under 25 represent 26 percent of employment in vulnerable industries.
  - 38 percent of workers under 25 are in highly exposed sectors.

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics
WHEN IS A JOB JUST A JOB – AND WHEN CAN IT LAUNCH A CAREER?

THE OPPORTUNITY FRAMEWORK

LIFETIME JOBS

Lifetime jobs are careers in themselves. They pay well and offer long-term stability but workers rarely advance to higher-level positions. E.g., Dental Hygienists.

SPRINGBOARD JOBS

Springboard jobs lead to careers. Workers often advance to different roles with more responsibility and greater pay within the same career area. E.g., HR assistants.

STATIC JOBS

Static jobs don’t typically lead to careers. They offer low pay compared to other middle-skill roles and suffer from high turnover. E.g., Medical assistants.
STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THE SHIFTING LABOR MARKET

Connect workers to high-demand, durable pathways

LEVERAGE LABOR MARKET INTELLIGENCE

Stay on top of local hiring trends and employer demand using both online job postings and data on job gains from local workforce boards and state labor market agencies.

As regions open and close their economies in response to viral spread and surges, the impact of the recession will evolve.

CONNECT ‘LIFEBOAT JOBS’ TO RESILIENT CAREERS

Build pathways between so-called lifeboat jobs, which are growing and require little or no retraining, to jobs that provide decent pay and long-term career opportunities.

Take advantage of parallels between the skills required in lifeboat jobs and those required in higher-paying, more stable roles in IT, health care, or business.

HELP WORKERS MOVE OUT OF VULNERABLE INDUSTRIES

Help displaced workers pursue more durable career pathways in sectors such as IT.

Provide targeted assistance—such as counseling, retraining, job search, and placement services—to support transitions.
The biggest [industries] and wealthiest [people] have been on a clear path toward recovery. Meanwhile, for most small businesses and those worst off, things have only become worse.

PETER ATWATER
Lecturer of economics,
College of William & Mary
EXPLORE LABOR MARKET DATA FOR YOUR COMMUNITY

RECOMMENDED RESOURCES

**Opportunity Insights Tracker**
State, metro, and county-level data on education, public health, employment, and business metrics.

**Unemployment Claims Monitor**
From the Federal Reserve Bank of Atlanta, this tool provides disaggregated data and visualizations of state-level unemployment claims.

**Visualizing Vulnerable Workers**
A tool from the Brookings Institution that shows you the number and percentage of vulnerable workers in your area.

**Emsi – Free Job Posting Dashboard**
State-level data on employer demand by industry, occupation, job title, skills, etc.
### Comparing the Impacts of the Great Recession, the COVID-19 Recession, and Automation

**Who and what were hardest hit?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AREA OF IMPACT</th>
<th>GREAT RECESSION</th>
<th>COVID-19 RECESSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Industries</strong></td>
<td>Construction Manufacturing</td>
<td>Leisure and Hospitality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mining, Quarrying, Oil and Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Transportation and Utilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Race/ethnicity</strong></td>
<td>Black and Hispanic people</td>
<td>Black, Hispanic, and Asian people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education level</strong></td>
<td>People with no postsecondary credential</td>
<td>People with no postsecondary credential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td>Young people ages 16-19</td>
<td>Young people ages 16-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Income</strong></td>
<td>Initial shock hit across multiple income levels</td>
<td>Initial shock hit low-wage workers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Society and the overall economy** | Jobless recovery
Wage stagnation                                                          | Physical distancing, remote work                                                 |
|                                  | Housing insecurity and food insecurity                                          | Health risks for essential workers                                               |
|                                  | Economy recovered slowly; effects lasted through 2019                          | Lack of child care                                                                |
|                                  |                                                                                 | Housing and food insecurity                                                       |
|                                  |                                                                                 | Economy opening and closing in fits and starts with regional variations, uncertain path to recovery |

*Similar conditions in both recessions*
[Cartoon by David Somerville, based on a two pane version by Hugh McLeod.]
Change in Demand by Industry

Total Job Postings Over Time by Industry: 2019-2020

- Transportation and Warehousing
- Retail Trade
- Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services
- Manufacturing
- Information
- Construction
- Arts, Entertainment, and Recreation
- Accommodation and Food Services
- Health Care and Social Assistance

Week of March 9, Widespread Economic Shutdowns
Shifting demographics in the workforce

Race/Ethnicity of Current and Emerging Workforces

- **Current Workforce**
  - White: 62%
  - Black: 12%
  - Latino: 17%
  - Asian: 6%
  - Native American: 1%
  - Other/Mixed: 2%

- **Emerging Workforce**
  - White: 52%
  - Black: 14%
  - Latino: 24%
  - Asian: 5%
  - Native American: 1%
  - Other/Mixed: 1%

- **Aging Workforce**
  - White: 75%
  - Black: 9%
  - Latino: 9%
  - Asian: 5%
  - Native American: 1%
  - Other/Mixed: 1%
Inequalities stem from exclusion across multiple systems

> If all workers should have good jobs, what is a good job?

| Strong compensation | Stable or growing employment | No existential threats |
Inequalities stem from exclusion across multiple systems

> How many of these jobs are there?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>% of Workers in Good Jobs</th>
<th>Total Workers in Good Jobs</th>
<th>Total Workers Short of Good Jobs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No College</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>12,019,300</td>
<td>88,799,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some College</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>3,092,400</td>
<td>14,579,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA+</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>35,851,300</td>
<td>6,028,400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Inequalities stem from exclusion across multiple systems

Educational Attainment by Race/Ethnicity and Nativity, United States, 2018

- White: 63% Less than a BA, 37% BA degree or higher
- Black: 78% Less than a BA, 22% BA degree or higher
- Latinx, US-born: 79% Less than a BA, 21% BA degree or higher
- Latinx, immigrant: 88% Less than a BA, 12% BA degree or higher
- Asian or Pacific Islander, US-born: 58% Less than a BA, 42% BA degree or higher
- Asian or Pacific Islander, immigrant: 56% Less than a BA, 44% BA degree or higher
- Native American: 85% Less than a BA, 15% BA degree or higher
- Mixed/other: 65% Less than a BA, 35% BA degree or higher
Covid-19 is deepening divides

Change in weekly job postings by occupational category and median annual earnings

- Less than $10,000
- $10,000 - $25,000
- $25,000 - $35,000
- $35,000 - $50,000
- $50,000 - $75,000
- $75,000 - $100,000
- $100,000 - $150,000
- $150,000 or more

Source: PolicyLink/PERE analysis of data from the 2018 5-year American Community Survey microdata from IPUMS USA and Burning Glass Technologies. Note: Universe includes the employed civilian noninstitutional population age 16 or older in occupations with valid data on weekly job openings between 3/2/2020 and 4/13/2020. See methodology for details.

*Get the data* • Created with Datawrapper
Covid-19 is deepening divides
Covid-19 is deepening divides

Non-essential jobs by change in weekly job postings, COVID-19 risk score, and racial/ethnic overrepresentation

- People of Color
- White

- Dining room and cafeteria attendants and bartender helpers
- Bartenders
- Interpreters and translators
- Executive secretaries and executive administrative assistants
- Manicurists and pedicurists
- Real estate brokers and sales agents
- Shipping, receiving, and inventory clerks

Change in Weekly Job Postings

COVID-19 Risk
How to board the lifeboats and where they may take you

Feeder Occupations
- Hotel, Motel, and Resort Desk Clerks
  - $25,130
- Baggage Porters and Bellhops
  - $26,990
- Maids and Housekeeping Cleaners
  - $15,570
- Amusement and Recreation Attendants
  - $23,460
- Retail Salespersons
  - $28,310
- Waiters and Waitresses
  - $25,830
- Hosts and Hostesses, Restaurants, Lounge, and Coffee Shop
  - $23,260
- Barbers, Hair Stylists, and Other Personal Care Workers
  - $23,010
- Claims Adjusters and Examiners
  - $17,540
- Engineering Technicians
  - $15,720
- Computer User Support Specialists
  - $15,050
- Audio and Video Equipment Technicians
  - $14,940

Skills You Carry Onboard
- Customer Service Scheduling
- Cleaning

Lifeboat Jobs
- Stock Clerks And Order Fillers
  - $28,520
  - Available jobs since March 2020
  - 87,531
- Inventory Management
  - Data Entry

Skills You Take Off The Lifeboat
- Cargo and Freight Agents
  - $46,070
- Production, Planning, and Expediting Clerks
  - $50,020
- Postal Service Clerks
  - $50,860
- Shipping, Receiving, and Traffic Clerks
  - $34,980
- Medical Secretaries
  - $37,590
- Medical Records and Health Information Technicians
  - $44,010
- Nursing Assistants
  - $29,580
- Medical Assistants
  - $34,540
- Information Security Analysts
  - $102,470
- Database Administrators
  - $92,030
- Network and Computer Systems Administrators
  - $87,070
- Business Operations Specialists
  - $76,960

Next-step Occupations
- Personal Care Aides
  - $25,050
  - Available jobs since March 2020
  - 51,393
- Patient Care Treatment Planning Record Keeping

Analyze skill adjacency to map the pathways to a more equitable future

- **Inventory Specialist**
  - $32,723
  - 31% people of color
  - Skills: Scheduling, Planning, Basic project management

- **Shipping Clerk**
  - $27,460
  - 41% people of color
  - Skills: Inventory management, Bills of lading, Excel

- **Operations Coordinator**
  - $37,100
  - 23% people of color
  - Skills: Scheduling, Planning, Basic project management
Analyze skill adjacency to map the pathways to a more equitable future

- **Compensation Analysts**
  - 27% Black, Hispanic, or Native American
  - $49,200

Skills:
- Financial Analysis
- Budgeting
- Financial Reporting
- Accounting

- **Financial Analysts**
  - 15% Black, Hispanic, Native American
  - $68,100

Seek students and recruits from more diverse roles with appropriate skills

Focus on skills that separate more diverse pools from better opportunity

Diversify from within
Necessary, Defining and Distinguishing Skills

- **Necessary Skills**: Skills relevant to the job, as well as other similar jobs. Building blocks for more complex Defining skills.
- **Defining Skills**: Tasks and responsibilities that define the job, and are required to work in the role.
- **Distinguishing Skills**: Advanced skills that are called for occasionally, but may command higher salaries and more intense demand.

Source: https://www.burning-glass.com/changing-the-way-we-think-about-skills/
Necessary, Defining and Distinguishing Skills

**Defining Skills**
- **Software Developer:** Test Driven Development, AWS
- **Financial Analyst:** Pivot Tables, Portfolio Management
- **Sales Manager:** CRM Systems
- **Project Manager:** MS Visio
- **Retail Store Manager:** Visual Merchandising
- **Building Maintenance:** Equipment Repair
- **Retail Associate:** Asset Protection
- **Office/Admin Assistant:** Payment Processing
- **Security Officer:** CPR

**Necessary Skills**
- **Project Manager:** MS Visio
- **Software Developer:** Test Driven Development, AWS
- **Financial Analyst:** Pivot Tables, Portfolio Management
- **Sales Manager:** CRM Systems
- **Retail Store Manager:** Visual Merchandising
- **Building Maintenance:** Equipment Repair
- **Retail Associate:** Asset Protection
- **Office/Admin Assistant:** Payment Processing
- **Security Officer:** CPR

**Distinguishing Skills**
- **Project Manager:** MS Visio
- **Software Developer:** Test Driven Development, AWS
- **Financial Analyst:** Pivot Tables, Portfolio Management
- **Sales Manager:** CRM Systems
- **Retail Store Manager:** Visual Merchandising
- **Building Maintenance:** Equipment Repair
- **Retail Associate:** Asset Protection
- **Office/Admin Assistant:** Payment Processing
- **Security Officer:** CPR
Monitor these indicators during a reopening of the economy

- **Jobs** that remain from before the crisis and re-emerge after
- **Health and safety implications** for business reopening
- **Reshoring**, new **supply chains**, and **automation** impacts of the Covid recession
- Increased emphasis on **remote work and learning**
- **Skills transfer** between declining and growing occupations

**Disparate impacts** of job loss and recovery on different population segments

https://nationalequityatlas.org/research/race-and-the-work-of-the-future
If you have additional questions or wish to discuss further, please contact:

Joel Simon  
Managing Director – Workforce Strategies  
jsimon@burning-glass.com  
(312) 513-1818
Building Equitable Pathways
Webinar Series

COMING SOON

Episode 3: Reimagining What It Means for Employers to Engage
Episode 4: From Policy to Practice: Creating Impact at Scale
Episode 5: Building Capacity for the Workforce of the Future

JANUARY AND FEBRUARY 2021
ENDNOTES