Spotlight Session: Leading for Equity

Josh Wyner, Executive Director
The Aspen Institute, College Excellence Program
September 28, 2018
What does it look like when colleges explicitly work to close equity gaps?
Outcomes of Prize Finalist Colleges

Far greater equity in outcomes than the national average

Three-year completion and/or transfer rates for underrepresented minority students compared to the national average

National Average: 34%
Finalist Average: 44%
Top 3 on This Metric: 59%
- Brazosport College (TX)
- Santa Barbara City College (CA)
- Santa Fe College (FL)
Why explicitly focus on equity as part of a student success reform agenda?
Because the U.S. is changing...


*Data from National Equity Atlas (nationalequityatlas.org)
...and so is Michigan.

Racial/ethnic composition: Michigan, 1980-2050

U.S. Census Bureau; NHGIS; Woods & Poole Economics, Inc.

*Data from National Equity Atlas (nationalequityatlas.org)
Because too many people live in poverty...

Percent people below poverty by race/ethnicity and nativity: Michigan, 100%, 2015

- All: 16.7%
- White, U.S.-born: 12.3%
- White, immigrant: 20.9%
- Black, U.S.-born: 34.8%
- Black, immigrant: 25.3%
- Latino, U.S.-born: 26.2%
- Latino, immigrant: 27.1%
- Asian or Pacific Islander, U.S.-born: 15.8%
- Asian or Pacific Islander, immigrant: 14.6%
- Native American: 21.8%
- Mixed/other: 29.4%

IPUMS

*Data from National Equity Atlas (nationalequityatlas.org)
..and not even those working can make ends meet

Percent working poor by race/ethnicity: Michigan, 200%, 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/ethnicity</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>15.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>18.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian or Pacific Islander</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native American</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed/other</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People of color</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

200% of the federal poverty level = approximately $24,000 per year

*Data from National Equity Atlas (nationalequityatlas.org)
Because education is the key to economic mobility...

Lifetime earnings

...but there are deep disparities in attainment.

Current educational attainment and projected state/national-level job education requirements by race/ethnicity and nativity: Michigan, AA degree or higher, 2015

IPUMS; Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce

Data from National Equity Atlas (nationalequityatlas.org) & Georgetown CEW
And because opportunity within institutions is inequitable.

*Students of color are underrepresented in STEM majors that lead to high median wages.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major</th>
<th>Percentage of bachelor's degree holders: African-American</th>
<th>Percentage of bachelor's degree holders: Hispanic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Electrical Engineering</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical Engineering</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical Engineering</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Engineering</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacy, Pharmaceutical Sciences, and Administration</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial and Manufacturing Engineering</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US Population</td>
<td>12% African-American</td>
<td>17% Hispanic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Terms like equality, inclusion, diversity, and equity are often used synonymously or in one phrase as a catch-all for institutional efforts to close achievement gaps among different racial/ethnic and socioeconomic groups.

- How many of you have an “Equity, Diversity, & Inclusion” Committee, Task Force, office, etc.?
These terms imply different goals and strategies.

Leading transformational change that eliminates race- and class-based disparities in student success requires clear goals that distinguish between these ideas and the strategies to achieve them.
Diversity is about representation and placing a value on colleges that reflect the communities and nation in which we live.
Inclusion describes the affirmative practices and mindsets that make all students, staff, and faculty feel welcome and valued and enable a community or college to be enriched by its diversity.

- *E.g.*, *Inclusive pedagogy*
Equality

- Equality is about opportunity and “leveling the playing field”.
  - *Marriage equality*
  - *Equal rights*
  - “*Equal treatment of equals*”
Equity is about outcomes, and fundamentally realigning institutional practice, policy, and mindset to ensure that all students can succeed.
Equity in what, for whom?

• **Equity in access:** the college proportionally enrolls students from every racial/ethnic, age, socioeconomic, or gender group relative to a community or service area.

• **Equity in learning:** the college ensures that differences in students’ academic preparation levels, abilities, and cultural backgrounds do not limit access to high-quality instruction and learning opportunities.

• **Equity in success:** there are no race- or class-based disparities in completion rates, AND completion rates in high-wage/high-demand fields and programs of study.
Aspen’s Equity Leadership Framework

Making the Case & Maintaining Urgency

Building a Culture of Equity

Defining and Measuring Equity

Enacting Strategies to Achieve Equity
Making the Case & Maintaining Urgency

• Articulate the “why” of equity
• Make the case early and continuously
• Harness the right data to make the case to different stakeholders
  • Demographic change
  • Workforce development and state ROI
  • Moral imperative
Making the Case & Maintaining Urgency

**Audience**

- Who in the region or institution cares about equity in postsecondary attainment and for what reasons?
- Who’s resistant to talking about equity and why?
- Who has influence to champion or derail equity as a regional or institutional priority?

**Framing & data**

- What frames/ narratives will resonate with different audiences?
- What data can be harnessed to build and maintain urgency for eliminating disparities linked to race/ethnicity, income, gender, and so on?
Bringing it all together

Framing

Data

Make the case

The ‘why’
Defining and Measuring Equity

**Absolute measures and gaps in:**

- Access (Institutional & High-Impact Programs/Practices)
- Learning
- Persistence, Transfer, & Completion
- Post-Completion Outcomes & Social Mobility
Enacting Strategies to Achieve Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Universal</th>
<th>Targeted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internal</strong></td>
<td><strong>External</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal internal</td>
<td>Universal external</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Targeted internal</td>
<td>Targeted external</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Enacting Strategies to Achieve Equity

### Universal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internal</th>
<th>External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Targets and strategies aimed at dramatically increasing # of students who finish credit math and English in first year through guided pathways design (Palo Alto, TX).</td>
<td>CC advisors in feeder high schools work to ensure that all students take math in senior year (Harper, IL).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Targeted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internal</th>
<th>External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latino and African-American students in STEM fields receive funding and extra time on task in first year math (UMBC, MD).</td>
<td>Guaranteed free tuition through bachelor’s degree for students from five highest poverty/minority high schools (NOVA, VA).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Building a Culture of Equity

- Establish Routines of Using Disaggregated Data
- Understand and Elevate the Student Experience & Voice
- Align Policies & Systems (Hiring, Financial Aid, Governance)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Making and Maintaining Urgency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- How can you make an equity case that this change is needed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- What specific data would support that case?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- How might you use the experience of diverse students as support?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defining and Measuring Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- What should the college be measuring?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Who should be reviewing data?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- What targets should be set?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacting Strategies to Achieve Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- What strategies can be implemented?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Systemic &amp; universal approach?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Targeted supports?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Partnerships?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building a Culture of Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- How can the college culture support equity in this area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- What specific policies &amp; systems need to be changed to ensure that these changes lead to more equitable outcomes?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Odessa College

Worked to close equity gaps through multiple strategies (AVID, 8-week courses, employee and student incentives). Odessa has closed gaps between Hispanic and White students in both course completion and grad rates.
Outcomes of Prize Finalist Colleges

Exceptional improvements over time in completion

Odessa College: Five-Year Trends

Graduation and Transfer Rate

Degrees per 100 FTE

2009-2010: 9.4
2010-2011: 24.6
2011-2012: 38.1
2012-2013: 38.1
2013-2014: 48.8
2014-2015: 48.8
Lessons from the Field

Marguerite Cotto
Vice President for Lifelong and Professional Learning, Northwestern Michigan College

Lee Hampton
Chief Diversity Officer, Jackson College
Questions? Reflections?
Thank you!

Josh.Wyner@aspeninstitute.org

http://highered.aspeninstitute.org

Twitter: @aspenhighered